

attack on archaeology's pretensions to science and a prediction that such aspirations will dissipate soon and be remembered unflatteringly. Gomes's chapter, meanwhile, assesses *caboclo* self-representation in the Amazon of Brazil. It is the most archaeologically technical of the chapters even as it touches on fieldwork and some contentious interactions between archaeologists and the indigenous community. The diversity of voices within the community influenced the work fundamentally and gives rise to a chapter that illustrates nicely the productive sloppiness of collaborative practice in opposition to a more sterile rigidity of typical scientific description.

Though pessimism regarding the effects of the interactions described here can be spurred by some specific situations (see Chapter 14 by Francisco M. Gil García), the gloom expressed by some as to the ability of the discipline to transform itself seems misguided and premature. Federico Navarrete's statement in Chapter 1 that, due to the fact that they are relatively small, a few ethnographic rooms on the second floor of the Museo Nacional de Antropología in Mexico are marginalized "just as current indigenous groups are marginalized from society" (47), seems facile and representative of a mindset that can find fault in whatever steps are attempted. Such a statement, along with much of what Dante Angelo writes in his chapter, captures a perspective that seems to expect the worst from the archaeological community by default. Coming from archaeologists, a recognition of the social sciences' imbrications in global inequality might be directed more thoroughly at existing evidence and evidentiary paradigms, rather than assumptions about motives or rapid readings of spatial relations. And it seems important to recall that current critiques

of archaeology have been prominent for a relatively short time; already they have promoted a substantial rethinking of the relationships between archaeologists and indigenous peoples. It is still in progress and will continue to be so for years to come.

The volume does well in presenting a wide array of situations, both optimistic and otherwise, in which archaeologists are actively engaging with indigenous groups and political structures. It aims to shake loose the institutional cobwebs and force the field to reconsider its obligations within the continually updated parameters of inquiry, politics, and truth. The attempts described here at opening up a way forward, in which indigenous people are given the legal and epistemic latitude owed to them in the investigation of histories that overlap with their own, are enlightening in their successes and failures alike. Practicing archaeologists—especially those working in South America—but also any who interact with indigenous communities in their research, are the seeming target audience of the piece and those to whom it speaks most directly. The ideas and approaches put forth might also be instructive for indigenous communities attempting to negotiate the battlefield of heritage rights and informative for anthropology students of anthropology who have reached at least advanced undergraduate standing.

**Intimate Enemies: Violence and Reconciliation in Peru.** *Kimberly Theidon*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2012. xiii+449 pp.

**Winifred Tate**  
Colby College

In her masterful ethnography of the legacies of violence in Ayacucho, Peru, Kimberly Theidon offers a critical intervention into discussions of postconflict reconstruction and transitional justice. She provides an illuminating ethnographic narrative, accessible to an interested public but theoretically sophisticated throughout, grounded in anthropology but carefully steeped in wide-ranging interdisciplinary reflections on issues of justice and moral life. Theidon's primary preoccupation turns on how concepts of justice, responsibility, reparation, reconciliation, and repentance emerging from Quechua communities intersect with multiple national and transnational projects of social transformation. These include the Shining Path, religious missions, and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC). As befits the complexities of the Peruvian case, the analysis escapes the left-right binaries shaping much of the discussions of insurgent-state violence. Theidon concentrates instead on the range of responses from communities, whose desire for order—and the multiple ways in which order is created—is often excluded from consideration.

The book is divided into four major sections, which examine in turn how embodied memories are manifested, issues of gender roles and identities in wartime, culpability, and reconciliation, and the contested process of recreating community. Theidon begins with the ways in which the TRC's process of knowledge production relied on biomedical models of "trauma," thus erasing the multiple forms of embodied memory experienced in rural communities. These include physical afflictions, pain, exhaustion, hardened hearts, and the desire to forget. She moves from these ongoing,

toxic memories to the production of personhood, including the ways in which children acquire humanness—and how adults can fall out of humanity—and ways in which wartime fears and memories damage children. Evangelical religion offered an alternative to the conservative Catholicism, replacing place-embedded saints with millennial militant theologies linked to Bible readings, including alternative visions of law and judgment. In the second section, heartrending accounts of what Theidon labels "womanly narratives of heroism" allow her subjects pride in agency and avoid slipping into the sly titillation all too frequent in accounts of wartime sexual violence. Even while interrogating the production of victim typologies that rely on the exalted figure of the wholly innocent, in Theidon's account women defend their strategic silences that are also critical forms of protection and power. She portrays the ongoing economic and emotional hardships of the new class of war widows, unable to participate in either traditional agricultural work or the infrastructure projects designed by well-meaning reconstruction agencies, while celebrating their new-found abilities to participate in local spaces of governance and become public figures.

In considering recrimination and reconciliation, Theidon examines how community mechanisms, including ritual battles and witchcraft that allowed members to manage conflict and maintain social order, were transformed into the use of lethal violence within and among communities and neighbors. Extended interviews with former Shining Path members explore the sensitive issues of why such militants chose to join, their hopes, and their reckoning with the violence their project unleashed. Soldiers in the community brought

security to some, while carrying additional risk to others, particularly to women. Reintegration required the reworking of agency as former militants offered their own calculations of conscience, minimizing their own with tales of *engaño* [being tricked] and misunderstandings. At the same time, communities are forced to reckon with their own capacity for retaliatory violence, how to rebuild an economically viable male labor force and resurgent memories demanding revenge, particularly by women and adolescent boys. Theidon wisely offers no set conclusions, but sets out an ambitious research agenda for future scholars, including the wartime anomalies of women and children, and advocates for the redistribution of shame to male rapists.

As with many ethnographies, the gradual narrative arc of the education of the anthropologist helps bring her English-speaking, presumably Western urban readers into this new world, as for example her attempts to cure local ills leads to a challenge from a witch/*curandero*, or when Theidon realizes that the assumed cuddly toddler is in fact a malnourished and developmentally delayed three and a half year-old. Her research spans decades, and a number of subject positions including academic, NGO consultant and TRC team leader. More detail on the methodological challenges and opportunities provided by this range of engagement would be welcome.

"Intimate Enemies" is not a community study intended to offer a detailed portrait of a single group. Rather, Theidon ranges among communities in the north and central-south of Ayacucho, thus illustrating the importance of comparing microhistories of complex violences and the distinct dynamics among even close

neighbors. She does not provide a linear background of contemporary Peruvian political history, rightly referring to myriad other documents, including the final report of the Peruvian Truth Commission itself, that could provide such an analysis. Yet her perspective is based on a community-based frame of analysis: She engages the world through the cultural categories she encounters, produced textually through extended vignettes. Much of the account consists of extended dialogues between community residents and the anthropologist. While in some cases overlong, these convey lyrically the complexity, agency, and open-ended struggle of individuals who draw on multiple epistemological frameworks to make sense of their tragic circumstances. For those readers, including this reviewer, who are not intimately acquainted with the intricacies of contemporary Peru, more historical scaffolding would be nice, as the community focus in some cases neglects the larger institutional and politics shifts that shaped those worlds. For example, while Theidon discusses reparations, the shifts in rural agricultural wage labor and the "political economy of forgiveness" (366), she provides little sense of the dramatic convulsions of the Peruvian economy and the scope of the transformations of rural economic life.

"Intimate Enemies" exemplifies hauntingly the power of the ethnographic method and demonstrates eloquently what anthropology can offer to contemporary debates. This theoretically informed examination of postwar Quechua communities takes us to the central questions of what makes us human? How do we live together? At a time when universities and in particular social science departments are coming under attack for their lack of

demonstrable worth, this work makes a vital case for importance of long-term, extended fieldwork and reflection.

**Holy Harlots: Femininity, Sexuality and Black Magic in Brazil.** *Kelly E. Hayes*, Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2011. 293 pp. 64-minute DVD included.

**Brian Brazeal**  
California State University, Chico

Kelly Hayes offers a glimpse into the world of Pomba Gira, a diabolical prostitute and demigoddess worshipped throughout Brazil, and especially on Rio de Janeiro's urban periphery. Pulp hagiographies and books of Pomba Gira spells abound in Brazil's popular religious press. But this is perhaps the first book-length academic treatment of this important Afro-Brazilian religious figure in any language.

The cult of Pomba Gira offers scholars a prism through which to understand gender and sexuality and their relations to violence and economic inequality in urban Brazil. It also offers a new perspective on the academic trajectory of the study of Afro-Brazilian religions. These traditions have been subject to ethnographic scrutiny for well over 100 years. Yet, otherwise brilliant scholars have consistently maligned or simply ignored the central figure of the Pomba Gira. There is typically little room in pious accounts of sanctioned forms of resistance and sacred beauty for a busty *mulata* who exposes her breasts, thrusts her pelvis forward and wields a decidedly Lucifer-esque trident. Even recent writings on Pomba Gira's male counterpart, Exú, seem to have shied away from the heady mix of sex, violence, maleficent sorcery, and not-quite benign love magic embod-

ied by this blood-soaked, devilish prostitute deity. In contrast, Hayes' treatment of Pomba Gira privileges practice over theology and a careful ethnographic examination of the roles that Pomba Gira plays in the lives of her devotees over this powerful figure's putatively African roots.

Hayes conducted fieldwork in the Acari Favela, one of the world's more dangerous neighborhoods. (Hayes is at pains to assure us that the young men who control the narcotics trade there are far more interested in shooting one another than in shooting innocent residents or visiting anthropologists.) Her primary informant is a middle-aged grandmother and housewife by the name of Nazaré. The ethnographic core of this book is a spiritual biography of Nazaré and her dealings with the Pomba Gira possession spirit named Maria Mulambo.

Hayes frames the biography of Nazaré with chapters on the political economy of the *favelas* and gender relations in contemporary Brazil. These chapters depict an urban periphery neglected by the state and taken over by youths working in the global cocaine trade. They describe a world where female sexuality is tightly, and occasionally violently, controlled by fathers and husbands for whom male philandering and female chastity are the cornerstones of masculine honor. Women are seemingly confined to their homes and domestic routines while their common-law husbands roam the street in search of lovers. These men are heralded as good fathers if they provide some material support to their families. They are tolerated as normal ones if they do not. The deceived husband [*cornio*] is the object of universal derision. The betrayed wife is a linguistically unmarked category because male marital fidelity is unheard of.